



No. CCF-5(12)/2024

Gilgit, dated 12th Nov. 2025

| FINAL TECHNICAL EVALUATION FOR CONSULTANCY SERVICES OF ARR PROJECT IN GILGIT-BALTISTAN | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--|---|------------|-----|--|------------------|-----------------|----------------|-----------------|-----------------|----------------|-----------------|----------------|
| Technical Evaluation Criteria (ITC 18.1) | | | | NAME OF FIRMS | | | | | | | | |
| Sr. | Technical Criteria | | | Asian | Integration Envi | STEPS | EMC | Himat | PETS | Green Growth | NESPAK | Reckonar |
| 1. | 1.1 General Experience (Maximum Points = 15) | | | Max Points | Marks Obtained | Marks Obtained | Marks Obtained | Marks Obtained | Marks Obtained | Marks Obtained | Marks Obtained | Marks Obtained |
| | 1.1.1 Bidder's (in case of a Consortium, technical member) experience of feasibility study of forest/ natural resource related projects completed during the last | | 06 | 00.0 | 00.0 | 00.0 | 06.0 | 06.0 | 06.0 | 06.0 | 03.0 | 06.0 |
| | 1.1.2 Bidder's (in case of a Consortium, any or all members combined) experience in conducting environmental impact assessment studies for | | 03 | 03.0 | 01.5 | 03.0 | 03.0 | 00.0 | 03.0 | 03.0 | 03.0 | 03.0 |
| | 1.1.3 Bidder's (in case of a Consortium, legal member) experience in preparing bidding package (including bidding documents and agreement, etc.) for | | 03 | 03.0 | 00.0 | 01.5 | 00.8 | 00.0 | 00.0 | 01.5 | 03.0 | 03.0 |
| | 1.1.4 Bidder's (in case of a Consortium, financial member) experience in developing financial model and project structuring for infrastructure | | 03 | 01.5 | 03.0 | 00.0 | 01.5 | 00.0 | 01.5 | 03.0 | 01.5 | 03.0 |
| | 1.2 Relevant Experience (Maximum Points = 40) | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | 1.2.1 Bidder (in case of Consortium, technical member) experience relating to the forest land use planning, mapping and carbon estimation, completed during | | 18 | 00.0 | 00.0 | 00.0 | 18.0 | 09.0 | 03.0 | 18.0 | 00.0 | 18.0 |
| | 1.2.2 Bidder (in case of Consortium, technical member) experience in preparation of Allometric equations of various tree species for carbon estimations | | 04 | 00.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 00.0 | 04.0 | 02.0 | 00.0 | 04.0 |
| | 1.2.3 Bidder's (in case of a Consortium, legal member) experience in preparing bidding package (including RFQ/ RFP and draft concession | | 06 | 06.0 | 00.0 | 01.5 | 02.0 | 00.0 | 00.0 | 00.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 |
| | 1.2.4 Bidder's (in case of a Consortium, financial member) experience in developing financial model, risk matrix and project structuring under the PPP or | | 06 | 02.0 | 06.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 00.0 | 04.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 06.0 |
| | 1.2.5 Bidder's (in case of a Consortium, financial member) experience in successfully achieving the Financial Closure for any project under the PPP or any | | 06 | 02.0 | 00.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 00.0 | 00.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 04.0 |
| Total Points (General and Relevant Experience) | | | 55 | | | | | | | | | |
| 2. | 2.1 Financial Team: | | 05 | | | | | | | | | |
| | i.Financial Team Leader | 3.0 points | | 03.0 | 03.0 | 03.0 | 03.0 | 03.0 | 03.0 | 00.5 | 03.0 | 03.0 |
| | ii.Project Finance Specialist | 2.0 points | | 02.0 | 02.0 | 01.7 | 02.0 | 01.5 | 02.0 | 00.9 | 02.0 | 02.0 |
| | 2.2 Technical Team: | | 20 | | | | | | | | | |
| | i.Technical Team Leader | 4 points | | 04.0 | 04.0 | 03.0 | 04.0 | 04.0 | 04.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 03.0 |
| | ii.Forest Expert | 2 points | | 02.0 | 02.0 | 01.7 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 |
| | iii.Carbon Expert | 2 points | | 00.0 | 02.0 | 01.3 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 01.1 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 |
| | iv.Civil Engineer / Surveyor | 2 points | | 02.0 | 01.5 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 |
| | v.Environment Expert | 2 points | | 02.0 | 02.0 | 01.7 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 |
| | vi.GIS/RS Expert | 2 points | | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 01.75 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 |
| | vii.Coordination & Communication Expert | 2 points | | 01.5 | 00.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 00.5 | 02.0 | 02.0 |
| | viii.Monitoring & Evaluation Expert | 2 points | | 01.7 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 |
| | ix.Social Safeguard Expert | 2 points | | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 |
| | 2.3 Legal Team: | | 05 | | | | | | | | | |
| | i.Legal Team Leader | 3.0 points | | 03.0 | 03.0 | 02.6 | 03.0 | 01.4 | 03.0 | 03.0 | 03.0 | 03.0 |
| | ii.Legal Expert | 2.0 points | | 02.0 | 01.5 | 01.7 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 02.0 | 01.7 | 02.0 |
| Total Points (Key Professional Staff) | | | 30 | | | | | | | | | |
| | 3.1 Average annual turn-over of last three (3) years | | 06 | | | | | | | | | |
| | i.≥ PKR 200 million | 6 points | | 06.0 | 06.0 | 06.0 | 06.0 | | 06.0 | 06.0 | 06.0 | 06.0 |
| | ii.≥ PKR 150 million and < PKR 200 million | 4 points | | | | | | | | | | |
| | iii.≥ PKR 85 million and < PKR 150 million | 2 points | | | | | | 01.0 | | | | |
| 4. | 4.1 Understanding of the Assignment | | 05 | N/A | N/A | N/A | 03.0 | N/A | 03.0 | 02.0 | N/A | 05.0 |
| | 4.2 Proposed Methodology with Work Plan containing pragmatic approaches towards achieving the Assignment's desired objectives and targeted milestones set in TOR within the stipulated timeline | | 04 | N/A | N/A | N/A | 03.0 | N/A | 02.0 | 02.0 | N/A | 04.0 |
| Total Points (Financial Capability) | | | 15 | | | | | | | | | |
| Grand Total Points (Technical) | | | 100 | 50.70 | 45.50 | 44.65 | 79.00 | 43.90 | 61.60 | 70.40 | 50.20 | 93.00 |
| RESULT | | | | Non- Responsive | Non- Responsive | Non- Responsive | Responsive | Non- Responsive | Non- Responsive | Responsive | Non- Responsive | Responsive |
| REMARKS | | | | * Firms/consultants securing a minimum score of 65 are responsive as per clause #23.1 of bid document and qualify for the Financial Bid opening. | | | | | | | | |

Sd _____
(Mujeeb Sardar)
Coordinator REDD+ GB
Member

Sd _____
(Dr. Farasat Ali)
PPL-GB WWF-Pak
Member

Sd _____
(Mohammad Yousuf)
Deputy Secretary, Forest Deptt.
Member

Sd _____
(Zurmast Khan)
Envi. Specialist, P&DD
Member

Sd _____
(Dr. Abdul Manan)
Asst. Professor KIU
Member

Sd _____
(Adnan Wali)
NRMO, GBRSP
Member

Sd _____
(Taseer Khan)
Accounts Officer, Finance Deptt.
Member

Sd _____
(Maryam Ahmed)
Consultant UNDP
Co-opted Member

Sd _____
(Mehmood Ghaznavi)
Chief Conservator Forests GB
Chairman